



## PCT

INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY EXAMINATION REPORT  
(PCT Article 36 and Rule 70)

Applicant's or agent's file reference PA133634/PCT		<b>FOR FURTHER ACTION</b> See Notification of Transmittal of International Preliminary Examination Report (Form PCT/IPEA/416)	
International application No. PCT/IB 03/03892	International filing date (day/month/year) 12.09.2003 ✓	Priority date (day/month/year) 30.10.2002 ✓	
International Patent Classification (IPC) or both national classification and IPC E21B10/56			
Applicant ELEMENT SIX (PROPRIETARY) LIMITED et al. ✓			
<p>1. This international preliminary examination report has been prepared by this International Preliminary Examining Authority and is transmitted to the applicant according to Article 36.</p> <p>2. This REPORT consists of a total of 5 sheets, including this cover sheet. ✓</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> This report is also accompanied by ANNEXES, i.e. sheets of the description, claims and/or drawings which have been amended and are the basis for this report and/or sheets containing rectifications made before this Authority (see Rule 70.16 and Section 607 of the Administrative Instructions under the PCT).</p> <p>These annexes consist of a total of    sheets.</p>			
<p>3. This report contains indications relating to the following items:</p> <p>I <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Basis of the opinion</p> <p>II <input type="checkbox"/> Priority</p> <p>III <input type="checkbox"/> Non-establishment of opinion with regard to novelty, inventive step and industrial applicability</p> <p>IV <input type="checkbox"/> Lack of unity of invention</p> <p>V <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Reasoned statement under Rule 66.2(a)(ii) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement</p> <p>VI <input type="checkbox"/> Certain documents cited</p> <p>VII <input type="checkbox"/> Certain defects in the international application</p> <p>VIII <input type="checkbox"/> Certain observations on the international application</p>			
Date of submission of the demand 24.05.2004 ✓		Date of completion of this report 16.02.2005	
Name and mailing address of the international preliminary examining authority:  European Patent Office D-80298 Munich Tel. +49 89 2399 - 0 Tx: 523656 epmu d Fax: +49 89 2399 - 4465		Authorized Officer Georgescu, M Telephone No. +49 89 2399-7502 	

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY  
EXAMINATION REPORT**

International application No. **PCT/IB 03/03892**

**I. Basis of the report**

1. With regard to the **elements** of the international application (*Replacement sheets which have been furnished to the receiving Office in response to an invitation under Article 14 are referred to in this report as "originally filed" and are not annexed to this report since they do not contain amendments (Rules 70.16 and 70.17)*):

**Description, Pages**

1-9 as originally filed

**Claims, Numbers**

1-14 as originally filed

**Drawings, Sheets**

1/2-2/2 as originally filed

2. With regard to the **language**, all the elements marked above were available or furnished to this Authority in the language in which the international application was filed, unless otherwise indicated under this item.

These elements were available or furnished to this Authority in the following language: , which is:

- ☐ the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of the international search (under Rule 23.1(b)).  
☐ the language of publication of the international application (under Rule 48.3(b)).  
☐ the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of international preliminary examination (under Rule 55.2 and/or 55.3).

3. With regard to any **nucleotide and/or amino acid sequence** disclosed in the international application, the international preliminary examination was carried out on the basis of the sequence listing:

- ☐ contained in the international application in written form.  
☐ filed together with the international application in computer readable form.  
☐ furnished subsequently to this Authority in written form.  
☐ furnished subsequently to this Authority in computer readable form.  
☐ The statement that the subsequently furnished written sequence listing does not go beyond the disclosure in the international application as filed has been furnished.  
☐ The statement that the information recorded in computer readable form is identical to the written sequence listing has been furnished.

4. The amendments have resulted in the cancellation of:

- ☐ the description, pages:  
☐ the claims, Nos.:  
☐ the drawings, sheets:

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY  
EXAMINATION REPORT**

International application No. PCT/IB 03/03892

---

5. ☐ This report has been established as if (some of) the amendments had not been made, since they have been considered to go beyond the disclosure as filed (Rule 70.2(c)).

*(Any replacement sheet containing such amendments must be referred to under item 1 and annexed to this report.)*

6. Additional observations, if necessary:

**V. Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement**

1. Statement

Novelty (N)	Yes: Claims	8, 9
	No: Claims	1-7, 10-14
Inventive step (IS)	Yes: Claims	8
	No: Claims	1-7, 9-14
Industrial applicability (IA)	Yes: Claims	1-14
	No: Claims	

2. Citations and explanations

**see separate sheet**

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY  
EXAMINATION REPORT - SEPARATE SHEET**

---

International application No. PCT/IB 03/03892

Reference is made to the following documents:

D1: US 5 979 571 A  
D2: US 2001/0035302 A1  
D3: EP 0 462 944 A  
D4: US 6 601 662 A

**V - Reasoned statement under Rule 66.2 (a)(ii)**

**V-1 Claims 1 and 12**

D1, which is considered as the closest prior art, describes a tool insert having the features described in claim 1 (see in particular fig. 10, 11 and 12 with ultra-hard material 24, protective layer 30, and used for milling and drilling column 5, lines 20-23).

The features of claim 12 are also disclosed by D1 as a "kicking off" process (25-30) consists of method steps as described in claim 12.

The subject-matter of claims 1 and 12 is therefore not new and the claims do not meet the novelty requirement of Art. 33(2)PCT.

**V-2 Claims 2 to 7 and 10 to 14**

The features of claims 2 to 7 and 10 to 14 are also known from D1 (see indications in the Search Report).

Therefore, also claims 2 to 7 and 10 to 14 do not meet the novelty requirement of Art. 33(2)PCT.

**V-3 Claim 8**

The feature of claim 8 does not appear to be disclosed or suggested by the prior art documents and can be seen as solving the problem of simplifying the production process of the substrate.

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY  
EXAMINATION REPORT - SEPARATE SHEET**

---

International application No. PCT/IB 03/03892

**V-4 Claim 9**

The feature of claim 9 is merely a normal design possibility suggested also by D3 or D4.

Therefore, claim 9 does not meet the requirement for inventive step of Art. 33(3) PCT.

The following objections are raised:

- a. The independent claims are not properly cast in the two part form, with those features which in combination are part of the closest prior art (D1) being placed in the preamble, contrary to the requirements of Rule 6.3(b) PCT.
- b. The features of the claims are not provided with reference signs placed in parentheses (Rule 6.2(b) PCT).
- c. Contrary to the requirements of Rule 5.1(a)(ii)PCT, the relevant background art disclosed in documents D1, D2 is not mentioned in the description, nor are these documents identified therein.